Argument Tool

Question
Clarify what we want to answer.

Our question is about ...

☐ A how or why explanation

☐ A design solution

Question:

How will elephant populations change?

Argument
Make and support a claim.

Claim (answers the question):

Support (relevant evidence and how the evidence links to science ideas):

Check:

✓ The claim answers the question.

✓ The support includes evidence from labs, readings, videos, or other sources.

✓ The support includes science ideas that we agree on.

✓ Each piece of evidence is linked to a science idea.

Critique
Evaluate the strength of an argument.

Evaluate the evidence:

Is the evidence clearly linked to the claim?

> The evidence is clearly linked to the claim because …
> The evidence is **not** clearly linked to the claim because …

Is there enough evidence that is clearly linked to the claim?

> There is enough evidence that is clearly linked to the claim because …
> There is **not** enough evidence that is clearly linked to the claim because …

Is any of the evidence from strongly biased sources?

> All/some/none of the evidence is from strongly biased sources because …

Are there additional limitations of the evidence?

A limitation of the evidence is ...

Consider alternative claims:

Does the evidence support the claim? Or does it better support an alternative claim?

All/some/none of the evidence supports the claim because …
Overall, the evidence better supports a claim that … because ...

Response
Respond to feedback.

Revise the original argument, OR:
State why critique(s) may not be valid. (Use the sentence starters for Critique if helpful.)

Resolution

Move toward consensus.

Is the argument strong enough for one claim to decide it is the best?
    If so, which claim?
OR: Is the best claim a combination of more than one claim?
OR: Is more information needed before we can decide on any claim?

> The best supported claim is …
> OR
> We need more information because ...

Is there anything we still don't have consensus on?